



## **Appendix E**

Section 1b:  
UCD Ballsbridge  
to City Centre Section -  
Pembroke Road Route  
Options Assessment  
MCA Table

Table E.1: Pembroke Road MCA

| Appraisal Criteria | Sub-Criteria                       | Option PR1<br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)   | Option PR2<br>(Removal of parking)  | Option PR3<br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)  | Option PR4<br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)  |
|--------------------|------------------------------------|---|---|--|--|
| 1 Economy          | 1A Capital Cost                    | <p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Major roadway widening and site clearance along the length of the section</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>1,150 sqm Private Land</p> <p>33 Properties affected</p> | <p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway widening and site clearance</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>135 sqm Private Land</p> <p>8 Properties affected</p> | <p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway realignment</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>151 sqm Private Land</p> <p>12 Properties affected</p> | <p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate kerb realigning and site clearance</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>0 sqm Private Land</p> <p>0 Properties affected</p> |
|                    | Rank                               |   |   |  |  |
|                    | 1B Transport Quality & Reliability | <p>Journey Time Inbound: 1.3 mins</p> <p>Journey Time Outbound: 1.3 mins</p> <p>Length: 0.518 km</p> <p>No. of Junctions: 0</p> <p>No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Full physical bus priority in both directions.</p>   | <p>Journey Time Inbound: 1.3 mins</p> <p>Journey Time Outbound: 1.3 mins</p> <p>Length: 0.518 km</p> <p>No. of Junctions: 0</p> <p>No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Full physical bus priority in both directions.</p>   | <p>Journey Time Inbound: 1.3 mins</p> <p>Journey Time Outbound: 1.3 mins</p> <p>Length: 0.516 km</p> <p>No. of Junctions: 0</p> <p>No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Full physical bus priority in both directions.</p>  | <p>Journey Time Inbound: 1.5 mins</p> <p>Journey Time Outbound: 1.5 mins</p> <p>Length: 0.51 km</p> <p>No. of Junctions: 0</p> <p>No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Bus priority provided by bus gate.</p>   |
|                    | Rank                               |   |   |  |  |

| Appraisal Criteria   | Sub-Criteria   | Option PR1<br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)   | Option PR2<br>(Removal of parking)  | Option PR3<br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)   | Option PR4<br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)   |
|----------------------|--|---|---|---|---|
| <b>2 Integration</b> | <b>2A Land Use Policy</b>                                  | Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area. | Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area. | Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area. | Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area. |
|                      | <b>Rank</b>  |   |   |   |   |
|                      | <b>2B Residential Population and Employment Catchments</b> | Similar Catchment for all route options.  |
|                      | <b>Rank</b>  |   |   |   |   |
|                      | <b>2C Transport Network Integration</b>                    | Similar potential along all route options.  |
|                      | <b>Rank</b>  |   |   |   |   |
|                      | <b>2D Cycle Network integration</b>                        | High quality Cycle facilities provided along Primary Route 13A in the GDA Cycle network plan.                   | High quality Cycle facilities provided along Primary Route 13A in the GDA Cycle network plan.                   | High quality Cycle facilities provided along Primary Route 13A in the GDA Cycle network plan.                   | High quality Cycle facilities provided along Primary Route 13A in the GDA Cycle network plan.                   |
|                      | <b>Rank</b>  |   |   |   |   |

| Appraisal Criteria | Sub-Criteria                          | Option PR1<br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)  | Option PR2<br>(Removal of parking)   | Option PR3<br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)  | Option PR4<br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)  |
|--------------------|---------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
|                    | <b>2E Traffic Network Integration</b> | <p>All traffic movements retained as per current arrangement.</p> <p>Removal of majority of parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility.</p> | <p>All through traffic movements retained as per current arrangement.</p> <p>Removal of all parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility.</p> | <p>In-bound through traffic restricted, however Northumberland Road and Morehampton Road are signed routes into City Centre. The inbound diversion length via Northumberland Road to Baggot Street Lower is 400m.</p> <p>No restrictions to outbound through traffic.</p> <p>No local access directly from the east end of the section. Local access much arrive via Waterloo Road / Baggot Street Upper, or via the other local diversions as appropriate.</p> <p>Removal of majority of parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility.</p> | <p>In-bound through traffic diverted, however onto Northumberland Road and Morehampton Road which are signed routes into City Centre. The inbound diversion length via Northumberland Road to Baggot Street Lower is 400m.</p> <p>Outbound through traffic must divert onto Waterloo Road towards Morehampton Road on towards R138 Stillorgan Road. The outbound diversion length via Haddington Road and Northumberland Road is 300m.</p> <p>Local access available directly from the east. Outbound local traffic must divert along Waterloo Road and then Wellington Road and/or Raglan Road.</p> <p>Removal of some parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility however to a lesser extent than other options.</p> |
|                    | <b>Rank</b>                           |  |  |  |  |

| <b>Appraisal Criteria</b>                     | <b>Sub-Criteria</b>                 | <b>Option PR1</b><br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)  | <b>Option PR2</b><br>(Removal of parking)   | <b>Option PR3</b><br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)  | <b>Option PR4</b><br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)  |
|---|-------------------------------------|---|---|---|---|
| <b>3 Accessibility &amp; Social Inclusion</b> | <b>3A Key Trip Attractors</b>       | All routes service the same trip attractors.  |
|   | <b>Rank</b>                         |   |   |   |   |
|   | <b>3B Deprived Geographic Areas</b> | All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.  | All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.  | All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.  | All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.  |
|   | <b>Rank</b>                         |   |   |   |   |
| <b>4 Safety</b>                               | <b>4A Road Safety</b>               | No. of junctions: 0<br>No turn movements required.  |
|   | <b>Rank</b>                         |   |   |   |   |
|   | <b>4B Pedestrian Safety</b>         | Footpaths provided throughout with dedicated signalised crossing points to connect footpaths as appropriate. Signalised crossings at all major junctions. | Footpaths provided throughout with dedicated signalised crossing points to connect footpaths as appropriate. Signalised crossings at all major junctions. | Footpaths provided throughout with dedicated signalised crossing points to connect footpaths as appropriate. Signalised crossings at all major junctions. | Footpaths provided throughout with dedicated signalised crossing points to connect footpaths as appropriate. Signalised crossings at all major junctions. |
|   | <b>Rank</b>                         |   |   |   |   |

| Appraisal Criteria   | Sub-Criteria                                  | Option PR1<br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)  | Option PR2<br>(Removal of parking)   | Option PR3<br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)  | Option PR4<br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)  |
|----------------------|---|--|--|--|--|
| <b>5 Environment</b> | <b>5A Archaeology &amp; Cultural Heritage</b> | <p>There is a Sites and Monuments Record (SMR) zone for Baggotrath Castle within the study area. The castle is listed on the Record of Monuments and Places (DU018-055)</p> <p>It is noted however that no works are proposed at the cited location, and that the castle was completely demolished, and no visible surface trace survives.</p> <p>There therefore is likely no impact to recorded monuments within the study area.</p> | <p>There is a Sites and Monuments Record (SMR) zone for Baggotrath Castle within the study area. The castle is listed on the Record of Monuments and Places (DU018-055)</p> <p>It is noted however that no works are proposed at the cited location, and that the castle was completely demolished, and no visible surface trace survives.</p> <p>There therefore is likely no impact to recorded monuments within the study area.</p> | <p>There is a Sites and Monuments Record (SMR) zone for Baggotrath Castle within the study area. The castle is listed on the Record of Monuments and Places (DU018-055)</p> <p>It is noted however that no works are proposed at the cited location, and that the castle was completely demolished, and no visible surface trace survives.</p> <p>There therefore is likely no impact to recorded monuments within the study area.</p> | <p>There is a Sites and Monuments Record (SMR) zone for Baggotrath Castle within the study area. The castle is listed on the Record of Monuments and Places (DU018-055)</p> <p>It is noted however that no works are proposed at the cited location, and that the castle was completely demolished, and no visible surface trace survives.</p> <p>There therefore is likely no impact to recorded monuments within the study area.</p> |
|                      | <b>Rank</b>                                   |  |  |  |  |
|                      | <b>5B Architectural Heritage</b>              | <p>Impact on the boundary of 31 no. protected structures. (Approx. 0.5m to 4.5m land acquisition)</p>  | <p>Impact on the boundary of 7 no. protected structures. (Approx. 0.5m to 1.5m land acquisition)</p>   | <p>Impact on the boundary of 11 no. protected structures. (Approx. 0.5m to 2m land acquisition)</p>  | <p>No impact on protected structures.</p>  |
|                      | <b>Rank</b>                                   |  |  |  |  |
|                      | <b>5C Flora &amp; Fauna</b>                   | <p>Requires the removal of <b>3</b> trees in public areas and <b>37</b> trees in private areas.</p> <p>Total trees impacted: <b>40</b></p>   | <p>Requires the removal of <b>11</b> trees in public areas and <b>10</b> trees in private areas.</p> <p>Total trees impacted: <b>21</b></p>  | <p>Requires the removal of <b>2</b> trees in public areas and <b>14</b> trees in private areas.</p> <p>Total trees impacted: <b>16</b></p>   | <p>Requires the removal of <b>0</b> trees in public areas and <b>0</b> trees in private areas.</p> <p>Total trees impacted: <b>0</b></p>   |
| <b>Rank</b>          |   |  |  |  |  |

| Appraisal Criteria | Sub-Criteria                             | Option PR1<br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)   | Option PR2<br>(Removal of parking)  | Option PR3<br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)   | Option PR4<br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)   |
|--------------------|--|---|---|---|---|
|                    | <b>5D Soils, Geology &amp; Hydrology</b> | No appreciable impact   | No appreciable impact   | No appreciable impact   | No appreciable impact   |
|                    | <b>Rank</b>                              |   |   |   |   |
|                    | <b>5E Landscape &amp; Visual</b>         | The widening works would require the removal of a number of the existing trees within the footpath. This scheme option would require land-take and removal of a significant number of trees outside the current road boundary. It is noted that 31 of the 33 properties impacted are on the Record of Protected Structures. | The widening works would require the removal of the majority of the existing trees within the footpath. This scheme option would require land-take and the removal of a number of trees outside the current road boundary. It is noted that 7 of the 8 properties impacted are on the Record of Protected Structures. | The widening works would require the removal of a number of the existing trees within the footpath. This scheme option would require land-take and removal of a number of trees outside the current road boundary. It is noted that 11 of the 12 properties impacted are on the Record of Protected Structures. | All existing trees would be retained, and no existing boundaries are affected.  |
|                    | <b>Rank</b>                              |   |   |   |   |
|                    | <b>5F Air Quality</b>                    | Potential impact on air quality due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Merrion Road and retention of both general traffic lanes.  | Potential impact on air quality due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Merrion Road and retention of both general traffic lanes.  | Potential positive impact on air quality due to only three lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.   | Potential positive impact on air quality due to only two lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic. |
| <b>Rank</b>        |  |   |   |   |   |

| Appraisal Criteria | Sub-Criteria                    | Option PR1<br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)  | Option PR2<br>(Removal of parking)  | Option PR3<br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)   | Option PR4<br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)   |
|--------------------|---------------------------------|--|---|---|---|
|                    | <b>5G Noise &amp; Vibration</b> | <p>Potential impact on noise and vibration due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Pembroke Road and retention of both general traffic lanes.</p> <p>The distance from the road edge to residential properties is decreased from existing on the southern side of the road over the majority of the section due to the road widening.</p> | <p>Potential impact on noise and vibration due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Pembroke Road and retention of both general traffic lanes.</p> <p>The distance from the road edge to residential properties is decreased from existing on the northern side of the road over the majority of the section due to the removal of parking. As the properties on the northern side of the road are relatively closer to the roadway, encroachment on this is considered to be more detrimental.</p> | <p>Potential positive impact on noise and vibration due to only three lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.</p> <p>The distance from the road edge to residential properties is decreased on the southern side of the road over the majority of the section.</p> | <p>Potential positive impact on noise and vibration due to only two lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.</p> <p>Proximity of road edge to residential properties is decreased significantly on both sides of the road over the majority of the section.</p> |
|                    | <b>Rank</b>                     |  |   |   |   |

| Appraisal Criteria | Sub-Criteria                        | Option PR1<br>(EPR Option realigned to avoid steps)   | Option PR2<br>(Removal of parking)  | Option PR3<br>(3-lanes with One-Way outbound)   | Option PR4<br>(2-lanes with Bus Gate)  |
|--------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---|---|--|
|                    | <p><b>5H Land Use Character</b></p> | <p>The widening works would require the removal of a number of the existing trees within the footpath. This scheme option would require land-take and removal of a significant number of trees outside the current road boundary. It is noted that 31 of the 33 properties impacted are on the Record of Protected Structures.</p> <p>This option would require the removal of the all on-street parking spaces on the southern side of the road, and a reduction in the number on the northern side.</p> <p>This option would reduce the footpath widths compared to existing, in an area of high pedestrian footfall.</p> | <p>The widening works would require the removal of a number of the existing trees within the footpath. This scheme option would require land-take and the removal of a number. It is noted that 7 of the 8 properties impacted are on the Record of Protected Structures.</p> <p>This option involves the removal of all on-street parking.</p> <p>This option would reduce the footpath widths compared to existing, in an area of high pedestrian footfall.</p> | <p>The widening works would require the removal of a number of the existing trees within the footpath. This scheme option would require land-take and removal of a number of trees outside the current road boundary. It is noted that 11 of the 12 properties impacted are on the Record of Protected Structures.</p> <p>This option would require the removal of all on-street parking spaces on the southern side of the road, and a reduction in the number on the northern side.</p> <p>This option would reduce the footpath widths compared to existing, in an area of high pedestrian footfall.</p> | <p>All existing trees would be retained and no existing boundaries are affected.</p> <p>This option would require the removal of a number of on-street parking spaces on the southern side of the road, and a reduction in the number on the northern side, however to a lesser extent than PR1 and PR2.</p> <p>This option would maintain or increase the footpath widths compared to existing, in an area of high pedestrian footfall.</p> |
|                    | <b>Rank</b>                         |   |   |   |  |